

DEFENSIVE FEDERAL LITIGATION
(JA 200)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 1: CASE MANAGEMENT, REPRESENTATION OF
GOVERNMENT DEFENDANTS, AND REMOVAL**

1.1	General	1-1
1.2	Coordination with the Department of the Army and the Department of Justice	1-2
1.3	Responsibility for Conducting Litigation.....	1-5
1.4	Representation of Individual Defendants.....	1-9
1.5	Removal of Cases	1-13

**CHAPTER 2: PRETRIAL PREPARATION AND PROCEDURE IN
FEDERAL LITIGATION**

2.1	General	2-1
2.2	Beginning the Litigation- Complaint and Answer	2-1
2.3	Pretrial Conferences--Rule 16.....	2-11
2.4	Dismissing the Complaint - Rule 12(b)	2-12
	a. Rule 12(b)(1), 12(b)(6): Subject Matter Jurisdiction and Failure to State a Claim	2-13
	b. Rule 12(b)(2), (4), (5): Personal Jurisdiction and Insufficiency of Process and Service	2-22
	c. Rule 12(b)(3): Venue	2-26
	d. Rule 12(b)(7): Indispensable Parties	2-27
2.5	Judgment on the Pleadings and Summary Judgment	2-30
	a. Rule 12(c): Judgment on the Pleadings	2-30
	b. Rule 56: Summary Judgment	2-31
2.6	Discovery	2-42
	a. Scope of Discovery	2-42
	b. Judicial Management of Discovery.....	2-46
	c. Protective Orders, Orders to Compel, Sanctions	2-50
	d. Privileges	2-62
	e. Discovery Devices	2-78
	(1) Depositions	2-78
	(2) Interrogatories.....	2-80

(3) Production of Documents	2-81
(4) Other Discovery Tools	2-82
2.7 Habeas Corpus Procedure	2-83

CHAPTER 3: FEDERAL JURISDICTION

3.1 Introduction	3-1
3.2 Federal Judicial Power	3-3
3.3 Congressional Grants of Jurisdiction.....	3-5
a. Introduction.....	3-5
b. Federal Question Jurisdiction.....	3-6
c. The Tucker Act	3-29
d. The Federal Tort Claims Act.....	3-46
e. Mandamus.....	3-50
f. Habeas Corpus.....	3-52
g. Civil Rights Jurisdiction.....	3-58
h. Other Jurisdictional Bases for Suit	3-58
3.4 Justiciability.....	3-59
a. General.....	3-59
b. Adversarial Prong	3-61
(1) Advisory Opinions.....	3-61
(2) Ripeness	3-63
(3) Mootness.....	3-65
(4) Standing.....	3-79
(a) General.....	3-79
(b) Purposes of Standing	3-80
(c) Constitutional Standing Requirements.....	3-82
(d) Prudential Standing Considerations	3-95
(e) Taxpayer Standing	3-106
(f) Organizational Standing.....	3-115
c. Political Question Prong	3-116

CHAPTER 4: FEDERAL REMEDIES

4.1 Introduction	4-1
4.2 Sovereign Immunity.....	4-1
a. General.....	4-1
b. Waivers of Sovereign Immunity.....	4-5
(1) Monetary Relief.....	4-5
(a) General.....	4-5

(b) Tucker Act.....	4-6
(c) Federal Tort Claims Act.....	4-7
(d) Other Statutes.....	4-8
(e) Commonly-Asserted Provisions Not Waiving Sovereign Immunity.....	4-9
(2) Nonmonetary Relief.....	4-10
(a) General.....	4-10
(b) Judicially-Created Exceptions.....	4-11
(c) Administrative Procedure Act (APA).....	4-12
(d) Other Statutes.....	4-14
4.3 Types of Remedies.....	4-14
a. Introduction.....	4-14
b. Monetary Relief.....	4-15
(1) Federal Tort Claims Act.....	4-15
(2) Tucker Act.....	4-15
(a) Scope of Tucker Act -- Absence of Substantive Rights	4-15
(b) Back Pay Claims	4-23
(c) Other Issues.....	4-34
c. Mandamus.....	4-35
d. Habeas Corpus.....	4-41
(1) Imprisonment	4-41
(2) Military Service -- Active Duty.....	4-44
(3) Military Service -- Reservists.....	4-46
e. Injunctions	4-49
(1) General.....	4-49
(2) Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 65.....	4-49
(3) Temporary Restraining Orders (TROs)	4-49
(a) General.....	4-49
(b) Procedure.....	4-50
(c) Burden of Proof.....	4-53
(4) Preliminary Injunctions.....	4-54
(a) General.....	4-54
(b) Procedure.....	4-54
(c) Elements and Burden of Proof.....	4-56
f. Declaratory Judgment	4-77
4.4 Conclusion.....	4-83

CHAPTER 5: THE DOCTRINE OF EXHAUSTION OF ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES

5.1	The Basic Concept.....	5-1
a.	General.....	5-1
b.	Purposes of the Exhaustion Doctrine.....	5-2
c.	Jurisdictional Nature of the Exhaustion Doctrine.....	5-3
d.	The Exhaustion Doctrine and the Statute of Limitations.....	5-4
5.2	What Remedies Must Be Exhausted?	5-7
a.	Introduction.....	5-7
b.	Army Board for the Correction of Military Records (ABCMR).....	5-7
(1)	General.....	5-7
(2)	Scope of Remedy.....	5-8
(3)	Composition and Procedures.....	5-9
(4)	Necessity of Recourse to the ABCMR.....	5-10
c.	ADRB.....	5-16
(1)	General.....	5-16
(2)	Scope of Remedy.....	5-16
(3)	Composition and Procedures.....	5-17
(4)	Necessity of Recourse to the ADRB.....	5-18
d.	Article 138, UCMJ.....	5-18
(1)	General.....	5-18
(2)	Scope of Remedy.....	5-19
(3)	Procedure	5-20
(4)	Necessity of Recourse to Article 138.....	5-20
e.	Other Administrative Remedies	5-22
5.3	Exceptions to the Exhaustion Doctrine	5-22
a.	Introduction.....	5-22
b.	Inadequacy/Futility.....	5-22
c.	Irreparable Injury.....	5-30
d.	Purely Legal Issues	5-31
e.	Avoid Piecemeal Relief	5-32

CHAPTER 6: REVIEWABILITY

6.1	General.....	6-1
a.	Early Cases	6-1
b.	Abrogation of the Presumption of	

	Nonreviewability.....	6-2
c.	Current Law	6-3
d.	Meaning of Nonreviewability.....	6-4
6.2	Reviewability Under the Administrative Procedure Act (APA).....	6-5
a.	Applicability to the Military.....	6-5
b.	Reviewability Under the APA.....	6-5
(1)	General.....	6-5
(2)	"Statutory Preclusion".....	6-6
(3)	"Committed to Agency Discretion by Law"	6-7
6.3	Reviewability Under the "Mindes Test"	6-18
a.	Background.....	6-18
b.	Reviewability Under <u>Mindes</u>	6-29

CHAPTER 7: SCOPE OF REVIEW OF MILITARY ADMINISTRATIVE DETERMINATIONS

7.1	Introduction	7-1
a.	Meaning of "Scope of Review".....	7-1
b.	"Scope of Review" Dependent Upon Nature of Challenged Administrative Determination.....	7-1
c.	Types of Military Administrative Determinations	7-2
7.2	Enlistment Contracts.....	7-2
a.	General Rule	7-2
b.	Recruiter Representations.....	7-6
c.	Remedy.....	7-6
7.3	Conscientious Objectors	7-7
7.4	Violations of Statutes and Regulations	7-10
a.	General Rule	7-10
b.	Prerequisites to Enforcement of Statute or Regulation.....	7-26
7.5	Constitutional Violations	7-26
a.	General.....	7-26
b.	Lower Court Applications of Deference	7-35
7.6	Discretionary Determinations	7-36
a.	Standards of Review.....	7-36
b.	Examples.....	7-37

CHAPTER 8: COLLATERAL REVIEW OF COURTS-MARTIAL

8.1	Introduction	8-1
8.2	Historical Overview.....	8-2
a.	General.....	8-2
b.	Collateral Review Before World War II	8-2
(1)	Early English Experience.....	8-2
(2)	Collateral Review in America Before the Civil War.....	8-4
(3)	Collateral Review in America From the Civil War to World War II	8-5
c.	Collateral Review From 1941-1953.....	8-7
(1)	General.....	8-7
(2)	Development of Civilian Habeas Corpus	8-7
(3)	Expansion of Collateral Review of Military Cases in the Lower Federal Courts	8-8
d.	Burns v. Wilson, 346 U.S. 137 (1953).....	8-8
8.3	Scope of Collateral Review	8-11
a.	The Demise of <u>Burns v. Wilson</u>	8-11
b.	Current Approaches to Collateral Review.....	8-11
c.	Recent Developments in Civilian Collateral Review	8-36
8.4	The Doctrine of Exhaustion of Military Justice Remedies	8-38
a.	General.....	8-38
b.	Exhaustion Before 1950.....	8-39
c.	Exhaustion After 1950	8-40
8.5	The Doctrine of Waiver.....	8-46
a.	General.....	8-46
b.	Waiver Before <u>Burns v. Wilson</u>	8-47
c.	Waiver Under <u>Burns v. Wilson</u>	8-47
d.	Waiver After the Demise of <u>Burns v. Wilson</u>	8-48

CHAPTER 9: OFFICIAL IMMUNITY

9.1	Introduction	9-1
a.	General.....	9-1
b.	Distinction Between Suits in Official and Individual Capacities	9-1
c.	Determining Individual Capacity Lawsuits	9-2
d.	Representation and Liability for Judgments.....	9-2
e.	Importance of Official Immunity.....	9-3
f.	Justifications for Official Immunity.....	9-3
g.	Types of Official Immunity.....	9-6

9.2	Types of Damages Claims	9-8
	a. General.....	9-8
	b. Common Law Torts.....	9-8
	c. Statutory Actions	9-9
	(1) General.....	9-9
	(2) 42 U.S.C. ' 1981	9-9
	(a) The Statute	9-9
	(b) Scope of the Remedy.....	9-10
	(3) 42 U.S.C. ' 1983	9-12
	(a) The Statute	9-12
	(b) Scope of the Remedy.....	9-13
	(4) 42 U.S.C. ' 1985	9-14
	(a) The Statute	9-14
	(b) Scope of the Remedy.....	9-15
	(5) Immunity.....	9-20
	d. Constitutional Torts.....	9-20
	(1) General.....	9-20
	(2) Historical Origins of the <u>Bivens</u> Doctrine	9-21
	(3) The <u>Bivens</u> Doctrine	9-23
	(4) Application of the Limits of the <u>Bivens</u> Doctrine.....	9-27
9.3	Immunities: General.....	9-41
	a. Introduction.....	9-41
	b. Threshold Determination--Scope of Duty	9-42
	c. Duty to Plead--Affirmative Defense.....	9-42
	d. Summary Judgment	9-43
	e. Appeals	9-43
	(1) General.....	9-43
	(2) Collateral Order Doctrine	9-44
	(3) Appealability of Immunity Decisions Under the Collateral Order Doctrine	9-45
	f. Sources of Immunity	9-46
9.4	Immunities: Constitutional	9-46
	a. General.....	9-46
	b. Application of the "Speech or Debate" Clause	9-46
9.5	Immunities: Statutory.....	9-47
	a. General.....	9-48
	b. Federal Employees Liability Reform and Tort Compensation Act.....	9-49
	(1) The Statute.....	9-49
	(2) Scope of Immunity	9-49

9.6	(3) Operation of the Statute.....	9-50
	(4) Application of the Statute.....	9-51
c.	The Gonzales Bill	9-51
	(1) The Statute.....	9-51
	(2) Purpose	9-52
	(3) Scope of Immunity	9-52
	(4) Operation of the Statute.....	9-54
d.	Immunity From Legal Malpractice	9-54
	(1) The Statute.....	9-54
	(2) Scope of Immunity	9-55
	(3) Operation of the Statute.....	9-55
	Immunities: Judicially-Created.....	9-56
a.	General.....	9-56
b.	Judicial Officers	9-58
	(1) Judges.....	9-58
	(2) Prosecutors.....	9-64
	(3) Public Defenders	9-67
	(4) Other Participants in Judicial Proceedings.....	9-68
c.	Executive Branch Officials	9-69
	(1) General.....	9-69
	(2) Common Law Torts	9-69
	(a) General Immunity of Federal Officials	9-69
	(b) Intra-Service Immunity.....	9-77
	(3) Constitutional Torts and Statutory Actions.....	9-78
	(a) General Rule: Qualified Immunity.....	9-78
	(b) Exception to the General Rule:	
	Executive Branch Officials	
	Performing Special Functions	9-95
	(c) <u>Feres</u> -Based Immunity in	
	Constitutional Tort Litigation.....	9-98

CHAPTER 10: JUDGMENTS, COSTS AND FEES

10.1	Introduction	10-1
10.2	Judgments and Settlements	10-1
	a. Judgments Against the United States.....	10-1
	b. Judgments Against Individual Dependents.....	10-5
	c. Interest on Judgments.....	10-6
10.3	Costs.....	10-7

a.	General.....	10-7
b.	Allowable Costs	10-8
c.	Procedure for Obtaining Costs	10-10
10.4	Attorney Fees and Other Expenses.....	10-11
a.	General.....	10-11
b.	Equal Access to Justice Act (EAJA).....	10-13